CHRISTCHURCH CALL

TO ELIMINATE TERRORIST
& VIOLENT EXTREMIST
CONTENT ONLINE

Christchurch Call Community Statements
SEPTEMBER 2022

.

This document contains statements by members of the Christchurch Call Community on their actions and progress towards Christchurch Call commitments. Members were invited to provide statements ahead of the Christchurch Call Leaders' Summit in September 2022.

Table of contents

Australia

Joined the Christchurch Call May 2019

Introduction

As a liberal democracy and founding supporter, Australia sees the Christchurch Call as an urgent catalyst for the international, cross-sector collaboration required to create a safe and secure online environment that promotes and uplifts inclusion and collective security, while protecting against online harms and eliminating extremist content.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

Australia continues to stand in solidarity with New Zealand in answering the Christchurch Call. In response, we have committed to major reforms, including implementing crisis response protocols for government and industry to disrupt live-streamed terrorist and extremist content. This protocol echoes the Call's objectives of building partnerships across sectors and fostering government-industry collaboration.

We are also continuing to enhance our legislative framework, introducing offences under the *Criminal Code Act 1995* and new regulations under the *Online Safety Act 2021*, which empower the eSafety Commissioner to take action against harmful material online, including terrorist and violent extremist content.

Australia maintains a strong commitment to capacity building initiatives, particularly with our regional partners. We look forward to co-hosting an Aqaba Process event with Indonesia in November this year, which will focus on crisis response, legislation, relationships with digital industry, and joining the global response to combat online terrorism and violent extremism. The event will promote the best practices principles of the Christchurch Call to Action.

Australia welcomes efforts from the Christchurch Call to align and take coordinated action against online service providers that refuse to moderate hateful and extremist content, especially given these platforms create a permissive environment for radicalisation.

As much as we look to build the resilience, unity and security of our society, we must work to create a safe and resilient online information environment. This landscape – and extremist actors within it – are constantly evolving. Through the Christchurch Call we can work collaboratively and innovatively against these threats and pursue a truly global response to ensure the internet remains safe, open and prosperous.

Czech Republic

Joined the Christchurch Call in May 2021

Introduction

The Czech Republic, in accordance with its Security Strategy, works actively to combat all forms of terrorism both at national level and through involvement in international organisations and initiatives. As a proud and active supporter of the Christchurch Call, we are committed to the mission of eliminating terrorist and violent extremist content online, while respecting human rights and building a free, open and secure internet.

The outrageous war led by the Russian federation against Ukraine, also including its virtual form by the Russian propaganda apparatus, has yet become another reminder that our democracies have a moral obligation to condemn such unjustified and illegal aggressive acts, but also that we must protect our own citizens against disinformation and the spread of violence, extremism and hate speech on the Internet.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

Terrorist and extremist content online ranks among the most pressing issues of today. Grasping the dynamically changing online environment and its possible misuse by various actors is a major challenge. The Czech Republic is aware of the relevance of these issues, and it is determined to address them vigorously. For instance, we are currently working on an effective implementation of The EU Regulation to address the dissemination of terrorist content online, and we expect a future positive impact of The EU Digital Services Act implementation. The Czech Republic continues to intensively investigate and prosecute cases of approving terrorist attacks.

The Czech Republic supports activities of different organisations and initiatives such as the EU Internet Forum, Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism or Tech Against Terrorism in the fight against extremist and terrorist content online. We highly appreciate all activities organised within the Christchurch call and a common effort of all these organisations and their members. Confidence and cooperation of states with the private sector is especially crucial for an effective mitigation of threats in the online environment.

Combating the misuse of the Internet for terrorist purposes and for spreading violent extremist propaganda is also one of the priorities of the Czech Presidency of the Council of the European Union and this topic is included in the work of its relevant Working Parties.

European Commission

Joined the Christchurch Call in May 2019

Introduction

The Christchurch Call is fully aligned with EU policies and actions to eliminate violent and terrorist content online.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

The EU has developed a twofold approach based on strong collaborative and legislative action to prevent the spread of terrorist and violent content online.

1. Collaborative action

The EU Internet Forum (EUIF) The EUIF established in 2015 gathers EU Member States, Europol, industry and civil society. It pursues the following key objectives in order to address the misuse of the online space for terrorist purposes: - development and effective implementation of the EU Crisis Response Protocol fully coordinated at global level; - support industry on an effective content moderation policy including with the support of the Europol's Internet Referral Unit and guidelines on violent right wing extremist groups, symbols and manifestos banned in EU Member States; - protect children online by cooperating with video gaming platforms; - address the role of content-sharing algorithms and their potential effects on the user journey towards radicalisation; - identify solutions to tackle the abuse of new technologies by violent extremists and terrorists including the growing use of terrorist operated websites; - engage with relevant platforms and services exposed to terrorist and violent extremist content (17 member companies so far) from diverse geographic areas and - enhance cooperation with other international fora and initiatives in particular GIFCT and the Christchurch Call.

2. Legislative measures

- • The EU Regulation to address the dissemination of terrorist content online entered into application in June 2022. The Regulation obliges internet platforms to remove terrorist content within one hour after receiving removal orders and to take proactive measures while safeguarding and protect fundamental rights, such as freedom of speech and right to information.

- • The Digital Services Act will set out new standards for the accountability of online platforms regarding the spread of illegal content, with the aim of creating a safer digital space where fundamental rights of all users are protected

EUIF webpage: https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/networks/european-unioninternet-forum-euif_en

Regulation to address the dissemination of terrorist content online: https://homeaffairs.ec.europa.eu/policies/internal-security/counter-terrorism-and-radicalisation/prevention-radicalisation/terrorist-content-online_en

Digital Services Act: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP_22_4313

India

A free, open, secure and largely unregulated Internet is a powerful tool to promote connectivity, enhance social inclusiveness and foster economic growth. However, Internet is not immune to abuse by terrorist and violent extremist actors. Past and recent events show that Internet-savvy terrorist groups and individuals use Internet for recruitment, fund raising, propaganda, radicalisation and other nefarious activities. India supports the Christchurch call aimed at curbing online extremism content.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

Media standards and frameworks

Government of India has on March 25, 2021, notified Information Technology (Intermediary Guidelines and Digital Media Ethics Code) Rules, 2021 issued under sub-section (1), clauses (z), (zg) of sub-section (2) of section 87 of the Information Technology Act, 2000 to channelize Social Media cyber space to ensure time bound liability and limit spread of hate content on various online platforms.

Government of India follows the crisis response protocol developed by GIFCT.

Rule 5 of Information Technology (Intermediary Guidelines and Digital Media Ethics Code) Rules, 2021 specifically mentions for Additional due diligence to be observed by an intermediary in relation to news and current affairs content. (Refer Annexure I)

Also Rule 2 sub rule (m), (n) & (o) of the Information Technology (Intermediary Guidelines and Digital Media Ethics Code) Rules, 2021 defines 'news and current affairs content, 'newspaper' and 'news aggregator' specifically.

Rule 9 refer to a 'Code of Ethics' (Refer Annexure II) laid down for media outlets with a 3 Level oversight mechanisms

> (a) Level I- Self-regulation by the publisher;
> (b) Level II – Self-regulation by the self-regulating bodies of the publishers;
> (c) Level III – Oversight mechanism by the Central Government

Please see more information at:

https://mib.gov.in/sites/default/files/IT%28Intermediary%20Guidelines%20and%20Digital%20Media%20Ethics%20Code%29%20Rules%2C%202021%20English.pdf

Ireland

Joined the Christchurch Call May 2019

Introduction

From Christchurch, to Buffalo, to Memphis, too often we are reminded of the necessity of working together to eliminate terrorist and violent extremist content online. The Christchurch Call has led the way in providing a framework for such cooperation – between Governments, with online service providers, and ensuring the voice of civil society is heard. Ireland is determined to play its part, as we strive to be a centre of excellence in the digital regulatory sphere.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

As a global ICT hub in Europe and a proud member of the European Union, Ireland is at the centre of efforts to regulate for a better and safer online environment. Significant new online safety legislation will soon be enacted in Ireland, introducing a robust regulatory framework for online safety and bringing to an end the practice of self-regulation in this space. These vital measures will target harmful online content on video sharing platforms and in livestreams, making online and offline spaces safer for our communities. Ireland's new Online Safety Commissioner will have the power to bring service providers within the scope of regulation and limit the spread of harmful content online. We are also introducing new enforcement powers so that those who facilitate the dissemination of harmful content must face the consequences of their inaction.

Ireland works closely with our European Union partners to enhance the collective contribution we can make to the aims of the Christchurch Call, including participation in the EU Crisis Protocol. First responders in Ireland are being trained to ensure a coordinated response to any future cross-border online crisis rooted in terrorism or violent extremism. We are taking steps to implement the EU Terrorist Content Online Regulation, and we participate in the Radicalisation Awareness Network, coming together with our fellow Europeans to share expertise on how to combat and prevent radicalisation.

Ireland continues to engage with and support the activities of the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism. It is vital that we in government work together with the technology industry, with civil society, and with academia to foster information-sharing and action to counter terrorist and violent extremist activity online.

Japan

Joined the Christchurch Call in May 2019

Introduction

The Christchurch Attack shook the world.

Japan believes medium- to long-term support is indispensable for countering terrorism and takes a three-layer approach: 1) enhancing capacity, 2) countering violent extremism, and 3) promoting socio-economic development.

The CC offers a vital opportunity to learn best practices on these agendas to counter TVEC globally.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

In June 2019, a month after joining the CC, Japan issued "G20 Osaka Leaders' Statement on Preventing Exploitation of the Internet for Terrorism and Violent Extremism Conducive to Terrorism" as the chair at the G20 Osaka Summit. ince the launch of GIFCT's Independent Advisory Committee, the government of Japan has acted as an advisory member, contributing to the debate on freedom of expression and effective online regulation with civil society members.

In Japan, after joining the CC, the government of Japan launched a public-private study group on exploitation of internet. Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, National Police Agency, private companies and NGOs regularly discuss how technology companies should take measures against TVEC. Also, a public and private contact list for crisis response on TVEC is underway.

The importance of countering violent extremism becomes greater than ever, especially with increasing opportunities for the youth to be influenced by information to commit acts of violence through the Internet and social media, due to their growing dependence on ICTs in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic.

In light of this, Japan has carried out various projects in cooperation with ASEAN countries and international organizations such as UNODC to prevent people from being inspired by violent extremism.

Specifically, through the Japan-ASEAN Integration Fund, which Japan established at the ASEAN Secretariat, we have been working to improve the capacity of authorities of ASEAN countries to prevent violent extremists from spreading extremist ideas through social media and the Internet, and to build a regional framework to combat cybercrime. We also support the youth in ASEAN countries in deepening of their knowledge of the rule of law against terrorism, cybercrime, and organized crime. And we support government agencies in capacity building to prevent terrorism, violent extremism, and hate speech against women.

Portugal

Joined the Call in September 2019

Introduction

Portugal would like to thank France and New Zealand for convening this important Leaders' Summit of the Christchurch Call Community. We welcome the joint efforts of the last four years that have contributed to prevent terrorist attacks, combat the proliferation of extremist propaganda and the continuous promotion of a free, secure and open internet.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call

Portugal is engaged in the implementation of the 24 commitments of the Christchurch Call Community. To do so, we have been strengthening the resilience and inclusiveness of our society to enable it to resist to terrorist and violent extremist ideologies; reinforcing international cooperation and sharing of good practices; developing with the private sector rapid responses to avoid and prevent the dissemination of terrorist or violent extremism content while also promoting and respecting human rights.

Additionally, on 7th June 2022, the European Union's Regulation on "Preventing the spread of extremist content online" entered into force. This legislative instrument requires platforms and social networks to remove, within one-hour, online terrorist content identified by Member States authorities, while ensuring respect for freedom of expression and information.

Through the Counter-Terrorism National Unit, Portugal has actively participated in projects with non-governmental organisations, academia and law enforcement agencies focusing on positive alternatives and counter-messaging.

We stand ready to continue supporting the Christchurch Call initiative and contributing to effectively counter violent extremism and radicalization, changing online behavior while maintaining an open internet consistent with human rights law.

Christchurch Call Advisory Network

He aha te mea nui o te ao? He tangata he tangata he tangata!

What is the most important thing in the world? It is people, it is people, it is people!

The Christchurch Call Advisory Network (CCAN) consists of not-for-profit organizations and individuals from civil society, academia, and the technical community convened as part of the Christchurch Call.

CCAN exists to provide expert advice on implementing the commitments in the Call in a manner consistent with international human rights law and a free, open, and secure internet.

We urge Governments and Online Service Providers to commit to:

1. Center the voices of affected communities in all Call work through meaningful engagement and consultation, including assessments of issues and impacts and identification and evaluation of solutions. The Muslim community in Aotearoa New Zealand, the Black American community in Buffalo, NY and many others continue to grapple with the consequences of terrorist violence and their perspectives and experiences must inform the work of the Call.
2. Recognise all forms of violence used in violent extremism and terrorism. That includes serial or systematic dehumanization of an out-group identified on the basis of a protected characteristic, as a form of psychological violence to suppress or silence communities.
3. Uphold Internet governance principles when undertaking the Call commitments: the protection and extension/enjoyment of human rights and maintaining open, secure, free, interoperable and global Internet through multistakeholder mechanisms are a key part of the Call to Action.[1]
4. Be accountable by reporting in writing and in detail, in a manner easily accessible to the public, on how they are undertaking each Call commitment. Such transparency is necessary in order to hold all members of the Call community who have the ability to regulate, set standards or otherwise impact the spread of terrorist and violent extremist content and behavior online accountable.
5. Align online service providers' policies and governments' legislative efforts with the commitments of the Call, including the commitment to "[c]ounter the drivers of terrorism

---

[1] There are an array of Internet governance principles laid out by CCAN members and others. We only mention a few as references and the references here do not mean CCAN endorsement: Global Network Initiative Principles, https://globalnetworkinitiative.org/gni-principles/, NetMundial Principles: https://netmundial.br/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/NETmundial-Multistakeholder-Document.pdf, and Internet Way of Networking, a set of principles the Internet Society has put forward: https://www.internetsociety.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/IWNIIAT-Defining-the-critical-properties-of-the-Internet.pdf

and violent extremism" and to enforce applicable laws "in a manner consistent with the rule of law and international human rights law, including freedom of expression."

6. Engage with CCAN to receive advice as to how their commitments can be undertaken without hampering human rights and a free, open and secure Internet.

The work of CCAN in 2021-2022:

1. Pilot project to evaluate how tech corporations and governments have upheld their commitments under the Call.
2. A dehumanization project. CCAN reviewed corporate and state definitions of dehumanising speech and discourse provided by CC Members. The research group at CCAN has developed a report providing strategies for designing policy frameworks to address this harm, suggesting it is a form of psychological violence against group identities, an attribute of TVEC and driver of terrorism and violent extremism.
3. Advice and consultation on the GIFCT Human Rights Impact Assessment, including final recommendations and extensive input into GIFCT workstreams, including the drafting of final outputs.
4. Advice and formal submissions on legislation in various jurisdictions and New Zealand's Crisis Response Protocol.

CCAN commitments

CCAN commits to balance a spectrum of civil society, internet governance, and human rights concerns, including the right to be free from deprivation of life and incitement to violence, as well as the right to free expression. CCAN also commits to diversifying its membership to include more members from underrepresented regions and communities.

Finally, we believe civil society should have a more pronounced role in policy development. Just as we advocate for online service providers to include civil society earlier in the design process, so too should governments in creating their policies. We urge the supporter companies and states to consult with CCAN to ensure that the Call values are incorporated and that the commitments enumerated in the Call to Action are undertaken in a manner that is consistent with the rule of law and international human rights law, and in a way that meets the needs of people and communities most impacted by TVEC.

GIFCT | Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism

GIFCT founding members signed and joined the Call in May 2019.

Introduction

Three years ago GIFCT's founders institutionalized the spirit of the Christchurch Call evolving GIFCT to an expert-led independent organization working with our now 19 technology company members. Together we've responded to over 270 attacks identifying any online dimensions and continued supporting fulfilment of industry's nine-point plan committed to the Call.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call community

Link to webpage: https://gifct.org/2022/09/09/gifct-progress-continues/

Global Partnership on Artificial Intelligence (GPAI) - Social Media Governance Project

A project of GPAI's Working Group on Responsible AI

Alistair Knott, Dino Pedreschi, Raja Chatila, Tapabrata Chakraborti

Do recommender algorithms influence users' attitudes towards TVEC? A proposed pilot study

Social media platforms provide highly *personalised* experiences for users, which is a considerable part of their appeal. Personalisation is delivered in large part by AI tools called **recommender systems**. For each user on a given platform, the recommender system learns what that user tends to engage with, and based on this learning, creates a content feed tailored to that particular user, choosing which incoming items are presented and withheld.

Recommender systems have a great deal of influence in the lives of social media users. Importantly, there are concerns this influence may push users towards 'extreme' content of various kinds (e.g. Brady et al., 2020; Rajthe et al., 2021). Recommender systems learn about user preferences by observing user clicks - but users tend to click on *what the recommender system offers them*, creating a potentially unstable feedback loop (Jiang et al., 2019). These concerns need to be further explored, using the best methods available. Our project at GPAI aims to study whether recommender systems push users towards extremist content, with a specific focus on Terrorist and Violent Extremist Content (TVEC).

Our focus is on identifying the best methods for asking this question. Last year, we surveyed methods for studying the effects of recommender systems on users (Knott et al., 2021). We concluded the best methods are those only available *within social media companies.* Accordingly, we recommended companies collaborate with external groups (including GPAI) to surface public findings about recommender system effects. We also proposed a specific family of methods that would surface the relevant information, without compromising user privacy, or company intellectual property. Our proposed methods trade on the fact that companies *already* study effects of recommender systems on users, in various ways, and for various purposes. GPAI's proposal is to make use of these existing methods to ask the outstanding questions about TVEC-related effects.

The idea that companies should collaborate with external stakeholders to run studies of recommender systems has gained traction this year, in particular in the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism (GIFCT). GIFCT's Transparency Working Group advocated collaborative studies of this kind, and cited GPAI's proposed study as an example (Whittaker, 2022). GIFCT's Technical Approaches Working Group made the useful proposal that companies could conduct **pilot studies**, to explore particular research designs, and again considered GPAI's study as a possible pilot (Thorley et al., 2022).

Pilot studies are very helpful in structuring difficult discussions about transparency in social media contexts. They allow legal and technical discussions to focus on how general transparency principles play out in specific companies. Pilot studies also fit directly into the Christchurch Call's ongoing workstream on algorithms, which notes a lack of publicly available evaluation data on recommendation systems, and seeks better understanding of their outputs (ChCh Call, 2021).

The most useful action that leaders at the Christchurch Call Summit can take in this area is to agree on a programme of pilot studies with individual companies, that investigate the effects of recommender system effects on users' relationship to TVEC.

References

Brady, W., Crockett, M. and Van Bavel, J. (2020). The MAD Model of Moral Contagion: The Role of Motivation, Attention, and Design in the Spread of Moralized Content Online. Perspectives on Psychological Science 15(4): 978-1010.

ChCh Call (2021). Algorithms and Positive Interventions Workstream.

Jiang, Chiappa, S., Lattimore, T., György, A. and Kohli, P. (2019) Degenerate Feedback Loops in Recommender Systems. AAAI/ACM Conference on AI, Ethics and Society, pp383-390.

Knott, A., Hannah, K., Pedreschi, D., Chakraborti, T. et al. (2021). Responsible AI for Social Media Governance: A Proposed Collaborative Method for Studying the Effects of Social Media Recommender Systems on Users. Global Partnership on Artificial Intelligence Summit report.

Rathje, S., Van Bavel, J. and van der Linden, S. (2021). Out-group animosity drives engagement on social media. PNAS 18:26.

Thorley, T., Llansó, E. and Meserole, C. (2022). Methodologies to Evaluate Content Sharing Algorithms and Processes. GIFCT Technical Approaches Working Group report.

Whittaker, J. and the GIFCT Transparency Working Group (2022). Recommendation Algorithms and Extremist Content: A Review of Empirical Evidence. GIFCT Transparency Working Group report.

Inclusive Aotearoa Collective Tāhono

Christchurch Call Advisory Network Member

Introduction

Inclusive Aotearoa Collective Tāhono works in the space of preventing violent extremism by building and supporting cross-sector community networks, working to improve belonging and inclusion. While we are a civil society organisation, this aligns with the first government commitment to counter the drivers of terrorism by strengthening resilience and inclusiveness.

Actions initiated, strengthened or contributed to since joining the Christchurch Call community

- Societal resilience and inclusiveness

- Legal measures

- Media standards and frameworks

- Regulations processes for online providers

- For Partner Organisations: Engagement with civil society organisations

- For CCAN: Engagement with the wider Call community

We work in ways that support Tino Rangatiratanga and Māori self-determination, and normalise Te Reo Māori and tikanga Māori.

Our work on cross-sector collaborations includes:

- A core group working on better media representation of minority communities, so that media stories work to improve belonging rather than dividing communities. Community conversations were to discuss good and problematic representation, with findings shared at a meeting with media organisations, soon to be published. The end goal is an on-going collaboration between communities and media.

- A partnership with community organisations and state agencies to develop a resource to improve inclusion of disabled people in faith communities. The resource will be based on a series of discussions between disabled people and people from faith communities, sharing their experiences and insights.

- A core group focused on anti-racism, particularly in the context of Te Tiriti o Waitangi. After initial conversations, a group has gathered to work together to educate and inform our communities about the effects of colonisation and racism and to address the backlash we are seeing to various initiatives to improve inclusion for Māori.

- A partnership supporting ethnic minority youth to be better connected to and engaged with policy makers

Further work in communities includes:

- Leading conversations in the community about belonging, some with a focus on the Māori concept of tūrangawaewae (we acknowledge the generosity of the National Iwi Chairs Forum in sharing this process with us). These conversations open up spaces to talk about how Te Tiriti o Waitangi strengthens everyone's rights.

- Training community and corporate organisations to have a values-based, human rights approach to inclusion, and providing them with tools to develop their own plans.

- A series of webinars, social media engagement and public speaking engagements that seek culture-change towards increased inclusion.

*[Please provide a **link to a webpage** with further information, if relevant.]*

inclusiveaotearoa.nz