Christchurch Call Community Insights 2022
A discussion guide

As Leaders gather to consider progress and our next steps, the Christchurch Call Community has developed insights for Leaders' consideration. These insights are intended to support Leaders in their conversation on 20 September 2022 on how we realise Call Commitments and our work plan objectives over the next year.

It reflects views from across the multistakeholder Community who contribute to our work, as expressed in preparatory discussions, and our 2022 survey and update report. Please note, this document reflects diverse views from across government, company, and civil society rather than a consensus from the entire Call Community.

Agenda Topic 1: Incident response, the proliferation of terrorist and violent extremist content

Two important objectives of the Call are to address the proliferation of terrorist content online, and to stop online services from being weaponised during an attack. This task is complex. It requires the Community to coordinate effectively and to share insights, stay ahead of evolving tactics and trends, and to continue testing and improving our systems and processes, and to ensure our desire to tackle the proximate issue does not come at the expense of human rights or a free, open, secure internet.

1A: Improve and update our incident response capability

We have made useful progress updating and testing our readiness. The evolving tactics of adversarial actors continue to challenge us.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
- Continue testing and improving our incident response systems including working towards a more inclusive approach to communication - Ensure incident response is more transparent and centres human rights. - Help build the capacity of smaller platforms to assist with incident response	Q Given what we saw in recent events, including in Buffalo NY, how can we sharpen our incident response capabilities? Q How do we realise our objectives in a landscape where many online service providers may not be capable of (or willing to) to join as a supporter of the Call? Q What role can researchers, civil society and community groups play in crisis response and communication? Q What if any blocks exist to increasing transparency around incident response and how can those be addressed?

1B: Address the proliferation of terrorist and violent extremist content online

A key issue for the Call Community is what to do about online service providers that refuse to moderate hateful and extremist content, given the role of these services in the radicalisation process and during crises. Community members have also raised questions around how online services beneath the application layer, such as internet infrastructure providers, should apply their terms of service in a proportionate fashion, and how their decisions impact on our work.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• The Call Community should work together to understand and analyse reservoirs of terrorist and violent extremist content, while setting clear expectations around transparency, consistency with human rights obligations and a free, open, secure internet	Q Unmoderated and alt tech services play a major role in the dissemination of TVEC – day-to-day and in crises. What options exist for the community to deal with this problem while respecting human rights and maintaining a free, open, and secure internet?

Topic 2: Algorithmic issues, social impacts, drivers, and interventions

The Call doesn't just aim to address the manifestation of terrorist and violent extremist content online, but also to understand and address its underlying drivers, and causes - both offline and online. That includes understanding the role algorithms and other processes may play in driving users towards terrorist and violent extremist content, and to apply that knowledge in designing effective interventions.

2A: Progressing our algorithmic work

There is a continuing high level of interest, and significant knowledge gaps regarding the role artificial intelligence and machine learning may play in facilitating engagement with terrorist and violent extremist content, and/or contributing to the radicalisation of users.

Technology companies, including Call supporters, use a diverse set of tools that incorporate artificial intelligence (AI) and/or machine learning technologies for a wide range of purposes.

- "Recommender algorithms," are the machine learning and AI processes that online platforms use to determine what content is recommended to users. Platforms may use "recommender algorithms" to decide what video is played automatically at the end of content a user has selected, or to determine what content gets priority in a user's timeline.

- Algorithmic content moderation processes are also of interest. Some platforms use machine learning and algorithmic tools to classify and remove content as terrorist and violent extremist content. That includes artificial intelligence tools like "natural language processing" that analyse written content, and machine learning processes trained to identify particular types of visual content.

There was a notable gap between survey respondents' assessment of effort expended and progress made. This is reflective of the complexity, technical, commercial, and ethical sensitivity of working in this area. The community should prioritise discussion on this issue and needs to make progress on this issue if we are to be effective in prevention.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• Develop multistakeholder processes that address the information needs of the Community, while managing genuine difficulty and complexity of this work, taking into account legal and proprietary restrictions on data sharing. • Provide a better evidence base for policymakers and for the development of interventions and other actions under the Call.	Q How do we move from talk to action on understanding algorithmic outcomes and where? Now we've identified some of the barriers and challenges, what are the things we need to do collectively to address them? Q What role can the Call play as new regulatory requirements are developed? Q What role can technology play in helping us overcome our gaps in knowledge and trust for algorithmic investigations?

2B: Address the drivers of radicalisation

In addition to understanding the role of human / AI-ML interactions in driving engagement with terrorist and violent extremist content, there remains a high level of interest in how we address offline drivers. Community members see a growing crossover between violent ideation, gender and anti-LGBTQIA+-based online harassment, dehumanising discourse, and mobilisation to violent extremist acts.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• Prioritise Community discussions on the topic of radicalisation, the social inputs and the online interactions that play a role in this, and effective intervention points. • Obtain more research and actionable insights about online gender and gender identity-based harassment and violence, and dehumanising discourse by violent extremist and terrorist groups	Q What more can we do to address the drivers of radicalisation to violence, and how can industry, civil society, and government work effectively together on that challenge? Q How do we address the specific threat from gender and gender-identity based online violence and harassment? Q What is the role of governments in offering legal clarity on how these issues should be addressed and how could this be informed by Call stakeholders, especially civil society?

Topic 3: Future-proofing the Christchurch Call, new technology and engagement with youth

To continue being effective into the future, the Christchurch Call must continue the job of building an effective, diverse, and engaged community that promotes global multistakeholder approaches and solutions. It must stay ahead of technological change and ensure that it speaks to the needs of young people who have the biggest stake in the future of the internet. It must also take an evidence-based approach to addressing new threats and harms including gender and gender identity-based violence and the role it plays in violent extremism.

3A: Strengthen the Call's approach to multistakeholder tech governance

The Christchurch Call is an important example of governments, industry and civil society working together, based on common values. To be effective it needs to continue its focus on global, inclusive solutions. Fulfilling the Call Commitments is a collective endeavour, given the complex issues and global internet. Our Community values the Christchurch Call's ability to convene across and within sectors and regions to discuss important issues, to share knowledge, and to work collectively on specific outputs.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• Focus on inclusive global solutions • Create more opportunities for collaborative work in the Community • Prioritise proactive information sharing by supporters, and more opportunities for transparency, debate, and seeking expertise and input. • Continue to focus on delivering the 24 Call Commitments.	Q "In an environment with diverse and potentially conflicting national regulatory approaches, how can we continue to champion a free and open global internet? Q How can governments, industry, and partner organisations operate more effectively in a multistakeholder environment? What should they do to better harness the expertise of the Call Community including civil society?

3B: Coordinate effectively with others

The Call Community should continue to advance work across a number of partners and fora, as well as in dedicated structures. People involved in the community work across a range of issues that intersect with the Call work in different ways and where they have the opportunity to add value. There should be clarity about how work is aligned and how we ensure visibility of work that is done in support of fulfilling the Call Commitments.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• Work alongside partners where there is clear alignment of objectives and values	Q How do we align our efforts with partners including the GIFCT across key areas of work?
• Avoid duplication, but find ways to bring work back to the Call Community for visibility and discussion	Q How, if at all, should the Call engage with complementary efforts elsewhere, e.g. to address disinformation or related issues that fall outside of its direct scope?

3C: Do inclusive outreach

Diversity is a cross-cutting issue for the Call's work programmes. It will add value to our work in a number of areas and will ensure what we're doing is relevant and effective.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders
• Include more diverse voices in our work including LGBTQIA+ and young people	Q What are the best ways to positively empower youth, LGBTQIA+ and communities impacted by T/VE as part of our work?
• Set up dedicated discussions with communities impacted by terrorism and violent extremism, including those living in regions not currently represented in the Call Community	

3D: Future proof our work under the Call

The Community is interested in ensuring the work of the Call remains relevant and effective as the internet evolves and the tactics of terrorist and violent extremist groups change with it.

The Community recommends a dedicated strand of effort aimed at understanding new technologies, the risks and opportunities they present, and how we deal with these while continuing to support a vibrant, evolving internet.

We should also consider how our work impacts the online experience for young people, the issues that disproportionately lead young people to radicalisation, and what we can do to leave them a legacy of a free, open, secure internet as a force for good.

Suggested actions	Discussion questions for Leaders

- Engage on the impacts of new technology across our work programme

- Speak directly with young people about our work, and hear their views on how we future proof our mission under the Call

- Devote more effort to communicating about the Christchurch Call's work and the positive change it is making

Q How should the Christchurch Call adapt as the internet moves from being a tool that sits 'in our pocket' to being all around us and an integral part of our daily experience of the world?

Q What can the Call Community do to support the adoption of new technologies in a manner that respects our commitment to human rights and a free, open, secure internet?

Q What does success look like for the Christchurch Call? How do we demonstrate to each other and to users around the world that what we're doing is working?

~